1 2

Aqueous contaminant removal by metallic iron: Is the paradigm shifting?

Noubactep C.

3 Angewandte Geologie, Universität Göttingen, Goldschmidtstraße 3, D - 37077 Göttingen, Germany;

4 Kultur und Nachhaltige Entwicklung CDD e.V., Postfach 1502, D - 37005 Göttingen, Germany.

5 e-mail: <u>cnoubac@gwdg.de;</u> Tel. +49 551 39 3191, Fax: +49 551 399379

6

7 Abstract

8 Chemical reduction has long dominated the thinking about the mechanism of aqueous contaminant removal in the presence of metallic iron (e.g. Fe⁰/H₂O systems). However, a 9 large body of experimental evidence indicates that chemical reduction is not adequate to 10 explain satisfactorily the efficiency of $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$ systems for several substances or classes of 11 12 substances. By contrast, the alternative approach, that contaminants are fundamentally 13 adsorbed and co-precipitated by iron corrosion products seems to provide a better explanation 14 of observed efficiency. The new approach is obviously not really understood. The present 15 communication aims at clarifying this key issue. It seems that a paradigm shift is necessary 16 for the further development of the iron technology.

17 Key words: Contaminant removal, Paradigm shift, Removal mechanism, Water treatment;18 Zerovalent iron.

191Introduction

20 The publication by Thomas Kuhn (1962) of his book "The structure of scientific revolutions" 21 is the starting point of the frequent use of the word "paradigm" in many fields of science. 22 Kuhn characterized a paradigm as a shared theory of the nature of something or of how it 23 operates, together with a related set of problems to be solved and a kit of tools or methods for 24 approaching those problems (Heaney, 2003; Rowbottom, 2011). Researchers introduced into 25 the field, learned about the paradigm. Their challenge is to apply some tools of the prevailing 26 paradigm to clarify some of its unsolved problems. For the field of water treatment with metallic iron (Fe^{0}), it is safe to say that contaminant reduction by Fe^{0} constitutes the basis of 27 28 its operative paradigm.

Since the introduction of Fe⁰ for water treatment in 1990 (Reynolds et al., 1990; Gillham and O'Hannesin, 1994), contaminants have been reported to be removed by reductive transformations (Matheson and Tratnyek, 1994; Weber, 1996; O'Hannesin and Gillham, 1998; Comba et al., 2011). Clearly, contaminants were considered to be removed because of their chemical transformations possibly making them less harmful (degradation) or less mobile (precipitation). Accordingly, the case for which contaminant reduction products may be more toxic than parent contaminants (e.g. CCl₄) is still actively discussed (Jiao et al., 2009;

Alvarado et al., 2010). Moreover, the formation of the universal oxide film on the Fe⁰ surface 36 37 (reactivity loss) and the pore filling by iron corrosion products (permeability loss) have been 38 regarded as the major inhibitive factors for the process of contaminant removal (Henderson 39 and Demond, 2007; Ghauch, 2008a; Simon et al., 2008; Li and Benson, 2010). Accordingly, three major opened problems of the Fe^0 technology are: (i) how can harmful reaction products 40 41 be removed? (ii) how can reactivity loss be prevented? and how can permeability loss be 42 properly considered? 43 Several analytical tools and complicated experimental devices has been used during the past 44 two decades to search for answers to these three questions (Wilderer et al., 2002; McGuire et al., 2003; Simon et al., 2004). Even today, a cursory survey of the literature on Fe⁰ technology 45

46 will find, in the introduction of virtually every paper, some such phrases as "...Fe⁰ is proved 47 to be particularly suitable for the decontamination of halogenated organic compounds, but 48 subsequent studies have confirmed the possibility of using Fe⁰ for the reduction of nitrate, 49 bromated, chlorate, nitro aromatic compounds, brominated pesticides. Fe⁰ proved to be 50 effective in removing arsenic, lead, uranium and hexavalent chromium..." (Groza et al., 51 2009). It is important to notice that "contaminant reduction" and "contaminant removal" are 52 mostly randomly interchanged.

53 It should be explicitly stated that some researchers have insisted on the importance of 54 adsorption and/or co-precipitation in the process of aqueous contaminant removal by Fe⁰ 55 (Burris et al., 1995; Allen-King et al., 1997; Lackovic et al., 2000; Lavine et al., 2001; 56 Furukawa et al., 2002; Ritter et al., 2002; Wilkin and McNeil, 2003; Su and Puls, 2004; 57 Mielczarski et al., 2005). However, their argumentation was limited either (i) to inorganic 58 contaminants (e.g. Lackovic et al., 2000; Wilkin and McNeil, 2003), (ii) to selected organic 59 species (e.g. Mielczarski et al., 2005) or (iii) to investigations on the impact of iron corrosion 60 products as contaminant scavengers (Furukawa et al., 2002, Jia et al. 2007) or reducing agents (Refait et al., 1998; Ritter et al., 2002; O'Loughlin et al., 2003; O'Loughlin and Burris, 2004; 61 62 Chaves, 2005; Liang and Butler, 2011). For example, Furukawa et al. (2002) stated that 63 under oxic conditions, ferrihydrite may be one of the most abundant iron corrosion products and may play an important role in adsorbing contaminants. In such situations, the use of Fe^{0} 64 reactive walls "may be extended to applications that require contaminant adsorption rather 65 than, or in addition to, redox-promoted contaminant degradation". On the other hand, the 66 findings of Lackovic et al. (2000) that arsenic is not removed by a reductive transformation 67 68 process war clearly presented as an exception. It is important to note that results from the very first peer-reviewed articles on the $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$ systems where uncertain about the real 69

70 mechanisms of contaminant removal (Table 1). However, the hypothesis of contaminant 71 reduction was favored without experimental proofs (e.g. mass balance) (e.g. Lee et al., 2004). 72 As stated by O'Hannesin and Gillham (1998), it was a "broad consensus".

73 The kit of tools to investigate contaminant reduction includes a large number of highly 74 sophisticated instruments for determining contaminant concentration and speciation, identifying contaminant reaction products and iron corrosion products as well (McGuire et al., 75 2003). Further used tools aimed at properly model experimental data and thus design field Fe^{0} 76 77 treatment units (e.g. field reactive walls, household filters) (Schüth et al., 2003; VanStone et 78 al., 2005; Li et al., 2006; Kouznetsova et al., 2007; Klammler and Hatfield, 2008; Li and 79 Benson, 2010; Jeen et al., 2011). Additionally, researchers were organized in networks (e.g. PRBT - the US Permeable Reactive Barriers Action Team; RUBIN - the German Permeable 80 81 Reactive Barrier Network; PRB-Net - the Permeable Reactive Barrier Network in the United Kingdom) having the goal to accelerate the development of the promising Fe⁰ technology. 82 Thus, it would seem that the role of reductive transformation in the process of contaminant 83 removal by Fe⁰ fulfils all of the criteria for a true paradigm. 84

- 85 It should be acknowledged that the reductive transformation concept has been a fruitful paradigm, fueling substantial progress for the achieved acceptance of the Fe⁰ technology 86 (Bigg and Judd, 2000; Scherer et al., 2000; Henderson and Demond, 2007; Laine and Cheng, 87 88 2007; Cundy et al., 2008; Thiruvenkatachari et al., 2008; Groza et al., 2009; Muegge and 89 Hadley, 2009; Phillips et al., 2010). Nevertheless, a growing body of evidence indicates that 90 factors other than reductive transformations contribute importantly to the process of 91 contaminant removal in $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$ systems. These factors included adsorption, co-precipitation 92 and adsorptive size exclusion.
- 93 2

Limits of the reductive transformation concept

Concordant reports on enhanced Fe⁰ reactivity towards aqueous contaminant removal with 94 decreasing particle size have been reported. As a consequence nano-scale Fe⁰ (nano-Fe⁰) has 95 been suggested and is currently injected in the subsurface for groundwater remediation (Wang 96 and Zhang, 1997; Comba et al., 2011; Shi et al., 2011). Another common tool to enhance Fe⁰ 97 98 reactivity is the use of bimetallic materials (Fe/Cu, Fe/Ni, Fe/Pd) (Muftikian et al., 1995). However, neither the use of nano-Fe⁰ (Noubactep and Caré, 2010a) nor that of bimetallic 99 100 systems (Noubactep, 2009a) is consistent with the fact that contaminants should be reduced by Fe^{0} . While the plating metal (e.g. Cu^{0} , Ni^{0} , Pd^{0}) are concurrent reagents for Fe^{0} oxidation, 101 nano-Fe⁰ will be readily oxidized by water which is in stoichiometric excess relative to 102

dissolved contaminants. These both facts ("anomalies") are the first arguments against theview that contaminants are quantitatively removed by reductive transformations.

105 Several other experimental results seem to have stretched the reductive transformation 106 paradigm to the point where it may no longer be intellectually satisfying. Among these results 107 (Noubactep, 2007; Noubactep, 2010a, Scott et al. 2011 and ref. therein): (i) the quantitative 108 removal of species like Zn^{II} which is not reducible by Fe^{0} or the quantitative removal of Mo^{VI} which is not readily adsorbed on iron oxides (at pH > 6), (ii) the quantitative removal of 109 organic species in Fe⁰ beds which were proven non reducible by Fe⁰ in batch systems (Lai et 110 al., 2006), (iii) the existence of the lag time in the process of contaminant removal in batch 111 112 systems (Schreier and Reinhard, 1994; Hao et al., 2005). Where the reductive transformation 113 paradigm is not useful, researchers have favored selective adsorption or microbial processes 114 to explain observed results (Lai et al., 2006). However, this approach can be regarded as a 115 falsification of the reductive transformation paradigm since it assumed that adsorption is only 116 important when reduction is not favorable. Moreover, contaminant co-precipitation with 117 precipitating and transforming iron oxides is considered only for specific cases as discussed 118 above. This is the juncture (proliferation of anomalies) at which Kuhn observes that 119 paradigms tend to shift (Heaney, 2003).

120 The expression "paradigm shift" is believed to be misused or overused in science. For this 121 reason this communication proposes that the reductive transformation paradigm is giving way 122 to a successor that seems to provide an operationally superior and an intellectually more 123 attractive rationalization of the process of aqueous contaminant removal by Fe⁰.

124 It must be acknowledged that the principle that contaminants are quantitatively removed in 125 $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$ systems has never been in question. The sole discussion is about the occurrence of 126 reduction (if applicable) and its extent (Lee et al., 2004). The next section will briefly present 127 a different view on the process of contaminant removal which is the essence of the alternative 128 paradigm. The new concept suggests in analogy with the historical work of Yao et al. (1971) 129 that contaminants are collected in Fe⁰ beds (deep bed filters) by in situ generated Fe^{II}/Fe^{II}-130 species regardless if they are chemically transformed or not.

131

3

Adsorption/co-precipitation concept

The concept that contaminants are fundamentally adsorbed and/or co-precipitated onto/with iron corrosion products in $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$ systems is extensively presented is several recent articles (e.g. Noubactep, 2010a; 2010b; 2011). The concept arose from a fortuitous observation during experiments on the process of uranium removal in "Fe⁰/MnO₂/H₂O" systems ["Fe⁰", "MnO₂" and "Fe⁰ + MnO₂"] (Noubactep et al., 2003) and is supported by results from all other branches of science involving aqueous iron corrosion (Noubactep, 2009b; Noubactep andSchöner, 2009; Noubactep and Schöner, 2010).

In the mentioned experiments, MnO_2 and waterworks sludge (aged iron oxides – Fe_2O_3) were 139 used as relevant adsorbents and their impact on the process of U^{VI} removal by Fe⁰ was 140 characterized. Results showed that none of the adsorbents could significantly accelerate U^{VI} 141 142 removal. Moreover, MnO₂ essentially retarded U^{VI} removal and the lag time was proportional to the available amount of MnO₂. These results indicated that U^{VI} is mostly removed by in-143 situ generated iron corrosion products. Aged Fe₂O₃ could not significantly impact U^{VI} 144 145 removal. MnO₂ essentially retarded the removal process. This delay is due to the fact that iron hydroxides are not precipitated in the vicinity of Fe⁰ but rather at the surface of MnO₂. The 146 process of reductive dissolution of MnO₂ by Fe^{II} is a well-documented geochemical process 147 (Stone, 1987; Stone and Ulrich, 1989; Postma and Appelo, 2000; Kang et al., 2006). 148

A close consideration of the impact of MnO₂ on the process of U^{VI} removal by Fe⁰ suggested 149 that U^{VI} removal is a characteristic of corroding iron. In other words, U^{VI} removal is not 150 necessarily a reductive process or a result of any specific interactions between U^{VI} and Fe^{0} . 151 Specific interactions between contaminants and Fe⁰ (and iron oxides) will certainly favour the 152 153 removal process but are not the determinant factors (Scott et al., 2011). Accordingly, a Fe⁰/H₂O system can be regarded as a domain of precipitating iron hydroxide (Noubactep, 154 2009c). In such a system, any inflowing contaminant will be adsorbed and co-precipitated. 155 Additionally, Fe^{II} and H/H_2 from continuously corroding Fe^0 are reducing agents for reducible 156 157 contaminants in the system but the extent of contaminant reduction is difficult to discuss 158 because generated iron oxides must be digested for contaminant speciation and mass balance 159 calculations. On the other hand, contaminants enmeshed in the matrix of iron corrosion are 160 stable for long time under environmental conditions whether they are chemically transformed 161 or not (Noubactep et al. 2006).

162 The presentation above has explained why all classes from aqueous contaminants may be quantitatively removed by Fe⁰. It is clear from this presentation that parent contaminants and 163 their reaction products are all removed in Fe⁰/H₂O systems. This is consistent with view that 164 in a Fe⁰ bed in situ generated Fe hydroxides and oxides act as contaminant "collectors" (Yao 165 166 et al., 1971). Accordingly, one of the three major opened problems (how can harmful reaction 167 products be removed?) from the reductive transformation concept is solved. The remaining 168 two problems are: (i) How can reactivity loss be prevented? and (ii) How can permeability 169 loss be properly considered? Answering these questions is over the scope of this 170 communication. However, it should be pointed out that recent theoretical works have shown 171 that to sustain system permeability, Fe^{0} should be admixed to inert materials in a volumetric

172 ratio lesser than 52 %. In other words an efficient Fe^0 bed could be regarded as a Fe^0 amended 173 sand filter. A proposed tool to sustain reactivity is to use Fe^0/MnO_2 mixtures (Noubactep et

174 al., 2010).

The concept presented in this section clearly belittles the importance of reduction in the process of aqueous contaminant removal in Fe^0/H_2O systems. There is increasing evidence that this concept is not yet understood by authors which have referenced related papers. The next section will address this issue.

179

4 Argumentation against the new concept

180 The concept regarding adsorption and co-precipitation as the fundamental mechanisms of contaminant removal in $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$ systems has been experimentally validated using methylene 181 182 blue as model contaminant (Noubactep, 2009d). The concept has recently been verified using 183 clofibric acid (Ghauch et al., 2010a) and diclofenac (Ghauch et al., 2010b). Moreover, the 184 similitude between contaminant removal with elemental metals and electrocoagulation has 185 been excellently presented by Bojic et al. (2004; 2007; 2009). Nevertheless, there are 186 currently five types of arguments in the literature belittling the significance of this concept: (i) 187 the concept is wrongly referenced (Luna-Velasco et al., 2010; Yuan et al., 2010) (argument 188 1), (iia) the concept is hardly acceptable because the reductive transformation concept is 189 widely accepted in the scientific community, (iib) self-citation is always used to support the 190 validity of the new the concept (Kang and Choi, 2009) (argument 2), (iii) Good results on removal of inorganic species by Fe^0 are unacceptably generalized (Ebert et al., 2007; 191 Tratnyek and Salter, 2010) (argument 3), (iv) data are needed to support the repeated claims 192 193 which negate more than one decade intensive research (Ebert et al., 2007; Tratnyek and 194 Salter, 2010) (argument 4), and (v) authors of the correct references deliberately further 195 referenced the concept or not (argument 5). For example, Flury and his colleagues (Flury et 196 al., 2009a; 2009b) referenced Noubactep (2006) in a paper for Applied Geochemistry 197 (available online 24 December 2008) and not in the paper for Environmental Science & 198 Technology (accepted May 14, 2009). In the meantime, three other more elaborated papers on 199 the new concept were available. Second example: Lo and co-workers have correctly referenced the concept in 2008 (Rao et al., 2009 - accepted 11 December 2008) and not in 200 201 several subsequent works (e.g. Liu et al., 2009, Mak et al., 2009; 2011). Short comments on 202 individual arguments will be given bellow.

Argument 1: The concept was introduced in 2007 in an open access journal (Noubactep, 204 2007). There is no reason why so many researchers could ignore or wrongly reference it.

Referencing articles using or presenting the new concept, co-precipitation is enumerated as a "simple" reaction mechanism beside adsorption and reduction (Luna-Velasco, et al. 2010; Yuan et al., 2010). The fact, that researchers are ignoring the state-of-the-art knowledge on the mechanism of contaminant removal in $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$ systems should be a concern for the whole community.

Argument 2: The consistency of the concept of reductive transformation has been extensively discussed while introducing the concept of adsorption/co-precipitation. Researchers should have discussed the validity of the new concept instead of simply doubt on its validity. Fortunately, Dr. Ghauch who was initially sceptic about the adsorption/co-precipitation concept (Ghauch, 2008b) has experimentally verified its efficiency to explain processes which are still mistakenly attributed to plated Fe^0 (Ghauch et al., 2010b).

216 Argument 3: Not all inorganic substances are readily adsorbed onto iron oxides (iron corrosion products) (Blowes et al., 2000). For example, Mo^{VI} is very poorly adsorbed on iron 217 218 oxides at pH > 6.0 (Scott et al., 2011 and references therein) but was reported to be successfully removed by Fe⁰ (Morrison et al., 2002; 2006). On the other hand, many organic 219 220 compounds are readily adsorbed onto iron oxides (Tipping and Higgins, 1982; Tipping, 1986; 221 Gu et al., 1994, Satoh et al., 2006; Hanna and Boily, 2010; Eusterhues et al., 2011). Besides 222 these hard facts from the geochemical literature, it has been clearly demonstrated that 223 contaminant removal is not primarily a property of contaminants but rather a characteristic of aqueous iron corrosion. In other words, contaminants are not removed by Fe⁰ or Fe oxides 224 separately, but during the whole dynamic process of aqueous iron corrosion. In Fe⁰ beds, 225 226 adsorptive size exclusion in a deep bed filtration mode sustains the removal efficiency. The 227 argument of self-citation is not acceptable because nobody else has systematically reported on 228 the inconsistency of the reductive transformation concept. Moreover, authors like Burris et al. 229 (1995), Lavine et al. (2001), Mantha et al. (2001), and Odziemkowski (2009), who have 230 seriously questioned some aspects of the reductive transformation concept, have been 231 constantly referenced.

Argument 4 is mostly used by reviewers and referees who have rejected several manuscripts and proposals. Rejected manuscripts were subsequently accepted by other reviewers sometimes from the same journal in a new submission. It is important in this regard to notice that many reviewers have argued that the reviews presenting the concept adsorption/coprecipitation could have never been published in ISI referenced journals (Noubactep, 2006; 2007) or in journals with higher impact factor (Noubactep, 2008) because of its poor scientific quality. While manuscripts could be revised and re-submitted, proposals have been systematically rejected. This is a well-known situation whenever a new view is introduced(Alm, 1992; Heaney, 2003).

Argument 5 suggests that the ground-breaking nature of the concept was not clear to the authors who may have been prompted by peer-reviewers to reference related works.

243 The comments above showed that no single valid argument against the adsorption/co-244 precipitation concept has yet been presented. Moreover, theoretical studies related to this 245 concept are a powerful guide for appropriate experimental designs (Noubactep and Caré, 2010a; 2010b; 2010c; Noubactep et al., 2009; Noubactep et al., 2010; Noubactep and Caré, 246 2011). On the other hand, regarding Fe^0 beds as "Fe⁰ amended sand filters" suggests that 247 population balance models that account for pore and particle size distributions along with 248 249 pore space topology (e.g. Bedrikovetsky, 2008) describe processes in dynamic $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$ 250 systems with better accuracy than currently used models (Jeen et al. 2011).

251 **5** Concluding remarks

The use of Fe^0 for water treatment was based on the thermodynamic valid argument that Fe^0 252 is a relative strong reducing agent ($E^0 = -0.44$ V/ESH). However, this assumption has 253 254 overseen at least two important aspects of aqueous iron corrosion and their thermodynamics: 255 (i) solubility of iron hydroxides, and (ii) adhesion of oxide scale on metal (Noubactep, 2010a; 2010b). In fact, whether contaminant reduction by Fe⁰ (direct reduction) occurs and 256 contributes significantly to the process of contaminant removal remains unclear. However, it 257 is certain that several groups of contaminants are quantitatively removed in $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$ systems 258 259 and that these contaminants are adsorbed and co-precipitated (Noubactep, 2009d; Ghauch et al., 2010a; 2010b). Adsorbed and co-precipitated contaminants could be further reduced by 260 electrons from Fe⁰ (direct reduction) but more likely by electrons from Fe^{II} or H/H₂ (indirect 261 reduction). Additionally, some contaminants could be oxidized in the systems by in-situ 262 263 generated Fenton-like reagents (Ghauch et al., 2010b). It is the aim of this communication to 264 propose the substitution of the reductive transformation concept by the one of adsorption/co-265 precipitation (and adsorptive size-exclusion).

It has been argued that "no paradigm passes painlessly" (Heaney, 2003). The scientific objectivity should dictate the fate of any scientific concept regardless from its age or what has been invested in it. To the author's opinion, the proposed paradigm shift does not represent a danger for any industry but rather a chance for more systematic system designs. For example the elimination of the constrains that contaminants should be reduced implies that surrogate parameters (e.g. dissolved organic carbon - DOC) can be used to monitor effluents for organics from treatment systems until breakthrough occurs. Afterwards more precise analytic 273 tools are needed to identify escaped organic species. On the other hand, the proposed new 274 paradigm has enabled a better bed design and clarified the controversial issue of using inert admixture in Fe⁰ beds (Noubactep et al., 2010). Furthermore, the new paradigm is about to re-275 vive Fe⁰ household filters, e.g. the 3-Kolshi filters (Khan et al., 2000; Hussam and Munir, 276 277 2007; Hussam, 2009). The 3-Kolshi filters have been abandoned because of poor design as 278 recently demonstrated (Noubactep et al., 2010). The 3-Kolshi filters were replaced by very 279 sustainable filters (SONO filters) in which iron shavings/fillings were substituted by a porous 280 Fe⁰-based composite (Hussam and Munir, 2007; Hussam, 2009).

281 The adsorption/co-precipitation concept has demonstrated that reduction is less important for 282 the process of contaminant removal than had been assumed. Because contaminants are progressively enmeshed in the matrix of iron corrosion products, they are even more stable 283 284 than if they were simply reduced or degraded. Accordingly, the proposed paradigm even sustains the acceptance of the Fe⁰ technology. Actually, nobody is in appreciable jeopardy 285 286 from the paradigm shift in course. Researchers are given more possibilities for rationale and systematic investigations of contaminant removal in $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$ systems as they could partly 287 288 paid less attention to contaminant speciation. It is hoped that this opportunity will be used for a rapid development of the Fe⁰ technology and its extension to other applications as recently 289 290 suggested by Antia (2010).

In conclusion, enhanced collaboration between experimental and modelling scientists is needed in order to expedite resolution of the key gaps in the understanding of the operation of processes governing the functionality of Fe^0 filtration systems. This closed collaboration is essential to frame new Fe^0 bed models.

295 Acknowledgments

296 The original manuscript was improved by the insightful comments from Angelika Schöner

- 297 (FSU Jena Germany). The manuscript was further improved by the insightful comments of
- anonymous reviewers from Water SA.

299 **References**

- ALLEN-KING RM, HALKET RM, and BURRIS DR (1997) Reductive transformation and
 sorption of cis- and trans-1,2-dichloroethene in a metallic iron-water system. *Environ. Toxicol. Chem.* 16, 424–429.
- ALM A (1992) Pollution prevention and TQM: Examples of paradigm shifts. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 26, 452–542.

- ALVARADO JS, ROSE C, and LAFRENIERE L (2010) Degradation of carbon tetrachloride
 in the presence of zero-valent iron. *J. Environ. Monit.* 12, 1524–1530.
- ANTIA DDJ (2010): Sustainable zero-valent metal (ZVM) water treatment associated with
 diffusion, infiltration, abstraction and recirculation. *Sustainability* 2, 2988–3073.
- BEDRIKOVETSKY P (2008) Upscaling of stochastic micro model for suspension transport
 in porous media. *Transp. Porous Med.* 75, 335–369.
- BIGG T, and JUDD SJ (2000) Zero-valent iron for water treatment. *Environ. Technol.* 21,
 661–670.
- 313 BLOWES DW, PTACEK CJ, BENNER SG, MCRAE CWT, BENNETT TA, and PULS RW
- 314 (2000) Treament of inorganic contaminants using permeable reactive barriers. J.
 315 Contam. Hydrol. 45, 123–137.
- BOJIC A, PURENOVIC M, and BOJIC D (2004) Removal of chromium(VI) from water by
 micro-alloyed aluminium based composite in flow conditions. *Water SA* 30, 353–359.
- 318 BOJIC A, PURENOVIC M, BOJIC D, and NDJELKOVIC T (2007) Dehalogenation of
- trihalomethanes by a micro-alloyed aluminium composite under flow conditions. *Water*SA 33, 297–304.
- BOJIC A, BOJIC D, and ANDJELKOVIC T (2009) Removal of Cu²⁺ and Zn²⁺ from model
 wastewaters by spontaneous reduction–coagulation process in flow conditions. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 168, 813–819.
- BURRIS DR, CAMPBELL TJ, and MANORANJAN VS (1995) Sorption of
 trichloroethylene and tetrachloroethylene in a batch reactive metallic iron-water system.
 Environ. Sci. Technol. 29, 2850–2855.
- 327 CHAVES LHG (2005) The role of green rust in the environment: a review. *Rev. Bras. Eng.*328 *Agríc. Ambient.* 9, 284–288.
- 329 COMBA S, DI MOLFETTA A, and SETHI R (2011) A comparison between field
 330 applications of nano-, micro-, and millimetric zero-valent iron for the remediation of
 331 contaminated aquifers. *Water Air Soil Pollut.* 215, 595–607.
- CUNDY AB, HOPKINSON L, and WHITBY RLD (2008) Use of iron-based technologies in
 contaminated land and groundwater remediation: A review. *Sci. Tot. Environ.* 400, 42–
 51.
- 335 EBERT M, BIRKE V, BURMEIER H, DAHMKE A, HEIN P, KÖBER R, SCHAD
- H, SCHÄFER D, and STEIOF M (2007) Kommentar zu den Beiträgen "Das Ende
 eines Mythos" sowie "Zur Funktion reaktiver Wände" von Dr. Chicgoua Noubactep.
- 338 *Wasser, Luft und Boden* **7-8**, TT4-5.

- EUSTERHUES K, RENNERT T, KNICKER H, KGEL-KNABNER I, TOTSCHE KU, and
 SCHWERTMANN U (2011) Fractionation of organic matter due to reaction with
 ferrihydrite: coprecipitation versus adsorption. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 45, 527–533.
- FLURY B, EGGENBERGER U, and MÄDER (2009a) First results of operating and
 monitoring an innovative design of a permeable reactive barrier for the remediation of
 chromate contaminated groundwater. *Appl. Geochem.* 24, 687–696.
- FLURY B, FROMMER J, EGGENBERGER U, MÄDER U, NACHTEGAAL M, and
 KRETZSCHMAR R (2009b) Assessment of long-term performance and chromate
 reduction mechanisms in a field scale permeable reactive barrier. *Environ. Sci. Technol.*43, 6786–6792.
- FURUKAWA Y, KIM J-W, WATKINS J, and WILKIN RT (2002) Formation of ferrihydrite
 and associated iron corrosion products in permeable reactive barriers of zero-valent iron.
 Environ. Sci. Technol. 36, 5469–5475.
- 352 GHAUCH A (2008a) Rapid removal of flutriafol in water by zero-valent iron powder.
 353 *Chemosphere* **71**, 816–826.
- GHAUCH A (2008b) Discussion of Chicgoua Noubactep on "Removal of thiobencarb in
 aqueous solution by zero valent iron" by Md. Nurul Amin et al. [Chemosphere 70 (3)
 (2008) 511–515]. *Chemosphere* 72, 328–331.
- 357 GHAUCH A, ABOU ASSI H, and TUQAN A (2010a) Investigating the mechanism of 358 clofibric acid removal in Fe⁰/H₂O systems, *J. Hazard. Mater.* **176**, 48–55.
- GHAUCH A, ABOU ASSI H, and BDEIR S (2010b) Aqueous removal of diclofenac by
 plated elemental iron: Bimetallic systems. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 182, 64–74.
- 361 GILLHAM RW, and O'HANNESIN SF (1994) Enhanced degradation of halogenated
 362 aliphatics by zero-valent iron. *Ground Water* 32, 958–967.
- 363 GROZA N, RADULESCU R, PANTURU E, FILCENCO-OLTEANU A, and PANTURU RI
 364 (2009) Zero-valent iron used for radioactive waste water treatment. *Chem. Bull.*365 "*POLITEHNICA*" Univ. 54, 21–25.
- GU B, SCHMITT J, CHEN Z, LIANG L, and MCCARTHY JF (1994) Adsorption and
 desorption of natural organic matter on iron oxide: mechanisms, and models. *Environ Sci Technol* 28, 38–46.
- 369 HANNA K, and BOILY J-F (2010) Sorption of two naphthoic acids to goethite surface under
 370 flow through conditions. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 44, 8863–8869.
- HAO Z, XU X, and WANG D (2005) Reductive denitrification of nitrate by scrap iron filings. *J. Zhejiang Univ. Sci.* 6B, 182–187.

- HEANEY RP (2003) Is the paradigm shifting? *Bone* **33**, 457–465.
- HENDERSON AD, and DEMOND AH (2007) Long-term performance of zero-valent iron
 permeable reactive barriers: a critical review. *Environ. Eng. Sci.* 24, 401–423.
- HUSSAM A (2009) Contending with a Development Disaster: SONO Filters Remove
 Arsenic from Well Water in Bangladesh. *Innovations* 4, 89–102.
- HUSSAM A, and MUNIR AKM (2007) A simple and effective arsenic filter based on
 composite iron matrix: Development and deployment studies for groundwater of
 Bangladesh. J. Environ. Sci. Health A42, 1869–1878.
- JEEN S-W, GILLHAM RW, and PRZEPIORA A (2011) Predictions of long-term
 performance of granular iron permeable reactive barriers: Field-scale evaluation. J.
 Contam. Hydrol. 123, 50–64.
- JIA Y, AAGAARD P, and BREEDVELD GD (2007) Sorption of triazoles to soil and iron
 minerals. *Chemosphere* 67, 250–258.
- JIAO Y, QIU C, HUANG L, WU K, MA H, CHEN S, MA L, and WU L (2009) Reductive
- dechlorination of carbon tetrachloride by zero-valent iron and related iron corrosion. *Appl. Catal. B: Environ.* 91, 434–440.
- 389 KANG K-H, LIM D-M, and SHIN H (2006) Oxidative-coupling reaction of TNT reduction
 390 products by manganese oxide. *Water Res.* 40, 903–910.
- KANG S-H, and CHOI W (2009): Response to comment on "oxidative degradation of
 organic compounds using zero-valent iron in the presence of natural organic matter
 serving as an electron shuttle". *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 43, 3966–3967.
- 394 KHAN AH, RASUL SB, MUNIR AKM, HABIBUDDOWLA M, ALAUDDIN M, NEWAZ
- 395 SS, HUSSAM A (2000) Appraisal of a simple arsenic removal method for groundwater
 396 of bangladesh. *J. Environ. Sci. Health* A35, 1021–1041.
- KLAMMLER H, and HATFIELD K (2008) Analytical solutions for flow fields near
 continuous wall reactive barriers. J. Contam. Hydrol. 98, 1–14.
- KOUZNETSOVA I, BAYER P, EBERT M, and FINKEL M (2007) Modelling the long-term
 performance of zero-valent iron using a spatio-temporal approach for iron aging. J.
 Contam. Hydrol. 90, 58–80.
- 402 KUHN T (1962) The Structure of Scientific Revolutions. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago
 403 Press.
- 404 LACKOVIC JA, NIKOLAIDIS NP, and DOBBS GM (2000) Inorganic arsenic removal by
 405 zero-valent iron. *Environ. Eng. Sci.* 17, 29–39.

- 406 LAI KCK, LO IMC, BIRKELUND V, and KJELDSEN P (2006) Field monitoring of a
 407 permeable reactive barrier for removal of chlorinated organics. *J. Environ. Eng.* 132,
 408 199–210.
- 409 LAINE DF, CHENG IF (2007) The destruction of organic pollutants under mild reaction
 410 conditions: A review. *Microchem. J.* 85, 183–193.
- 411 LAVINE BK, AUSLANDER G, and RITTER J (2001) Polarographic studies of zero valent
 412 iron as a reductant for remediation of nitroaromatics in the environment. *Microchem. J.*413 **70**, 69–83.
- 414 LEE G, RHO S, and JAHNG D. (2004) Design considerations for groundwater remediation
 415 using reduced metals. *Korean J. Chem. Eng.* 21, 621–628.
- LI L, and BENSON C (2010) Evaluation of five strategies to limit the impact of fouling in
 permeable reactive barriers. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 181, 170–180.
- LI L, BENSON CH, and LAWSON EM, (2006) Modeling porosity reductions caused by
 mineral fouling in continuous-wall permeable reactive barriers. *J. Contam. Hydrol.* 83,
 89–121.
- LIANG X, and BUTLER EC (2011) Effects of natural organic matter model compounds on
 the transformation of carbon tetrachloride by chloride green rust. *Water Res.* 44, 2125–
 2132.
- 424 LIPCZYNSKA-KOCHANY E, HARMS S, MILBURN R, SPRAH G, and NADARAJAH N 425 (1994) Degradation of carbon tetrachloride in the presence of iron and sulphur
- 426 containing compounds. *Chemosphere* **29**, 1477–1489.
- LIU T, RAO P, MAK MSH, WANG P, and LO IMC (2009) Removal of co-present chromate
 and arsenate by zero-valent iron in groundwater with humic acid and bicarbonate. *Water Res.* 43, 2540–2548.
- LUNA-VELASCO A, SIERRA-ALVAREZ R, CASTRO B, and FIELD JA (2010) Removal
 of Nitrate and hexavalent uranium from groundwater by sequential treatment in
 bioreactors packed with elemental Sulfur and zero-valent iron. *Biotechnol. Bioeng.* 107,
 933–942.
- MAK MSH, RAO P, and LO IMC (2009) Effects of hardness and alkalinity on the removal of
 arsenic(V) from humic acid-deficient and humic acid-rich groundwater by zero-valent
 iron. *Water Res.* 43, 4296–4304.
- MAK MSH, RAO P, and LO IMC (2011) Zero-valent iron and iron oxide-coated sand as a
 combination for removal of co-present chromate and arsenate from groundwater with
 humic acid. *Environ. Pollut.* 159, 377–382.

- MANTHA R, TAYLOR KE, BISWAS N, and BEWTRA JK (2001) A continuous system for
 Fe⁰ reduction of nitrobenzene in synthetic wastewater. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 35, 3231–
 3236.
- 443 MATHESON LJ, and TRATNYEK PG (1994) Reductive dehalogenation of chlorinated
 444 methanes by iron metal. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 28, 2045–2053.
- 445 MCGUIRE MM, CARLSON DL, VIKESLAND PJ, KOHN T, GRENIER AC, LANGLEY
- LA, ROBERTS AL, and FAIRBROTHER DH (2003) Applications of surface analysis
 in the environmental sciences: dehalogenation of chlorocarbons with zero-valent iron
- 448 and iron-containing mineral surfaces. *Anal. Chim. Acta* 496, 301–313.
- MIELCZARSKI JA, ATENAS GM, MIELCZARSKI E (2005) Role of iron surface oxidation
 layers in decomposition of azo-dye water pollutants in weak acidic solutions. *Appl. Catal.* **B56**, 289–303.
- MORRISON SJ, METZLER DR, and DWYER BP (2002) Removal of As, Mn, Mo, Se, U, V
 and Zn from groundwater by zero-valent iron in a passive treatment cell: reaction
 progress modeling. *J. Contam. Hydrol.* 56, 99–116.
- MORRISON SJ, MUSHOVIC PS, and NIESEN PL (2006) Early Breakthrough of
 Molybdenum and Uranium in a Permeable Reactive Barrier. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 40,
 2018–2024.
- 458 MUEGGE JP, and HADLEY PW (2009) An evaluation of permeable reactive barrier projects
 459 in California. *Remediation* 20, 41–57.
- 460 MUFTIKIAN R, FERNANDO Q, and KORTE N (1995) A method for the rapid
 461 dechlorination of low molecular weight chlorinated hydrocarbons in water. *Water Res.*462 29, 2434–2439.
- 463 NOUBACTEP C, MEINRATH G, DIETRICH P, and MERKEL B (2003) Mitigating
 464 uranium in ground water: prospects and limitations. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 37, 4304–
 465 4308.
- 466 NOUBACTEP C (2006) Contaminant reduction at the surface of elemental iron: the end of a
 467 myth (in German). *Wasser, Luft und Boden* 50 (11/12), **11-12**, TT11–14.
- 468 NOUBACTEP C, SCHÖNER A, DIENEMANN H, and SAUTER M (2006) Investigating the
 469 release of co-precipitated uranium from iron oxides. *J. Radioanal. Nucl. Chem.* 267, 21–
 470 27.
- 471 NOUBACTEP C (2007) Processes of contaminant removal in "Fe⁰–H₂O" systems revisited. 472 The importance of co-precipitation. *Open Environ. J.* **1**, 9–13.

- 473 NOUBACTEP C (2008) A critical review on the mechanism of contaminant removal in Fe^{0} -474 H₂O systems. *Environ. Technol.* **29**, 909–920.
- 475 NOUBACTEP C (2009a) On the operating mode of bimetallic systems for environmental
 476 remediation. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 164, 394–395.
- 477 NOUBACTEP C (2009b) Metallic iron for environmental remediation: Learning from the
 478 Becher Process. J. Hazard. Mater. 168, 1609–1612.
- 479 NOUBACTEP C (2009c) An analysis of the evolution of reactive species in Fe^0/H_2O systems.

480 *J. Hazard. Mater.* **168**, 1626–1631.

- 481 NOUBACTEP C (2009d) Characterizing the discoloration of methylene blue in Fe^0/H_2O 482 systems. J. Hazard. Mater. **166**, 79–87.
- 483 NOUBACTEP C (2010a) The fundamental mechanism of aqueous contaminant removal by
 484 metallic iron. *Water SA* 36, 663–670.
- 485 NOUBACTEP C (2010b) Elemental metals for environmental remediation: Learning from
 486 cementation process. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 181, 1170–1174.
- 487 NOUBACTEP C (2010c) The suitability of metallic iron for environmental remediation,
 488 *Environ. Progr.* 29, 286–291.
- 489 NOUBACTEP C (2011) Comment on "Reductive dechlorination of γ-hexachloro490 cyclohexane using Fe–Pd bimetallic nanoparticles" by Nagpal et al. [J. Hazard. Mater.
 491 175 (2010) 680–687]. J. Hazard. Mater. (Accepted 22 Mar 2011).
- 492 NOUBACTEP C, and CARÉ S (2010a) On nanoscale metallic iron for groundwater
- 493 remediation. J. Hazard. Mater. 182, 923–927.
- 494 NOUBACTEP C, and CARÉ S (2010b) Dimensioning metallic iron beds for efficient
 495 contaminant removal. *Chem. Eng. J.* 163, 454–460.
- 496 NOUBACTEP C, and CARÉ S (2010c) Enhancing sustainability of household water filters
 497 by mixing metallic iron with porous materials. *Chem. Eng. J.* 162, 635–642.
- 498 NOUBACTEP C, and CARÉ S (2011) Designing laboratory metallic iron columns for better
 499 result comparability. *J. Hazard. Mater.*, doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2011.03.016.
- NOUBACTEP C, and SCHÖNER A (2009) Fe⁰-based alloys for environmental remediation:
 Thinking outside the box. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 165, 1210–1214.
- 502 NOUBACTEP C, SCHÖNER A, and WOAFO P (2009) Metallic iron filters for universal
- 503 access to safe drinking water. *Clean Soil, Air, Water* **37**, 930–937.
- NOUBACTEP C, and SCHÖNER A (2010) Metallic iron for environmental remediation:
 Learning from electrocoagulation. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 175, 1075–1080.

- 506 NOUBACTEP C, CARÉ S, TOGUE-KAMGA F, SCHÖNER A, and WOAFO P (2010)
- 507 Extending service life of household water filters by mixing metallic iron with sand.
 508 *Clean Soil, Air, Water* 38, 951–959.
- 509 O'HANNESIN SF, and GILLHAM RW (1998) Long-term performance of an in situ "iron
 510 wall" for remediation of VOCs. *Ground Water* 36, 164–170.
- 511 O'LOUGHLIN EJ, and BURRIS DR (2004) Reduction of halogenated ethanes by green rust.
 512 *Environ. Toxicol. Chem.* 23, 41 –48
- 513 O'LOUGHLIN EJ, KEMNER KM, and BURRIS DR (2003) Effects of AgI, AuIII, and CuII
 514 on the reductive dechlorination of carbon tetrachloride by green rust. *Environ. Sci.*515 *Technol.* 37, 2905 –2912.
- 516 ODZIEMKOWSKI M (2009) Spectroscopic studies and reactions of corrosion products at
 517 surfaces and electrodes. *Spectrosc. Prop. Inorg. Organomet. Compd.* 40, 385–450.
- 518 PHILLIPS DH, VAN NOOTEN T, BASTIAENS L, RUSSELL MI, DICKSON K, PLANT S,
- AHAD JME, NEWTON T, ELLIOT T, and KALIN RM (2010) Ten year performance
 evaluation of a field-scale zero-valent iron permeable reactive barrier installed to
 remediate trichloroethene contaminated groundwater. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 44, 3861–
 3869.
- 523 POSTMA D, and APPELO CAJ (2000): Reduction of Mn-oxides by ferrous iron in a flow
 524 system: column experiment and reactive transport modelling. *Geochim. Cosmochim.*525 Acta 64, 1237–1247.
- RAO P, MAK MSH, LIU T, LAI KCK, and LO IMC (2009) Effects of humic acid on
 arsenic(V) removal by zero-valent iron from groundwater with special references to
 corrosion products analyses. *Chemosphere* 75, 156–162.
- REFAIT PH, ABDELMOULA M, and GÉNIN J-MR (1998) Mechanisms of formation and
 structure of green rust one in aqueous corrosion of iron in the presence of chloride ions. *Corros. Sci.* 40, 1547–1560.
- 532 REYNOLDS GW, HOFF JT, and GILLHAM RW (1990) Sampling bias caused by materials
 533 used to monitor halocarbons in groundwater. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 24, 135–142.
- RITTER K, ODZIEMKOWSKI MS, and GILLHAM RW (2002) An in situ study of the role
 of surface films on granular iron in the permeable iron wall technology. *J. Contam. Hydrol.* 55, 87–111.
- ROWBOTTOM DP (2011) Kuhn vs. Popper on criticism and dogmatism in science: a
 resolution at the group level. *Stud. Hist. Phil. Sci.* A42, 117–124.

- SATOH Y, KIKUCHI K, KINOSHITA S, and SASAKI H (2006) Potential capacity of
 coprecipitation of dissolved organic carbon (DOC) with iron(III) precipitates. *Limnology* 7, 231–235.
- 542 SHI Z, NURMI JT, and TRATNYEK PG (2011) Effects of nano zero-valent iron on 543 oxidation-reduction potential. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **45**, 1586–1592.
- 544 SCHREIER CG, and REINHARD M (1994) Transformation of chlorinated organic
 545 compounds by iron and manganese powders in buffered water and in landfill leachate.
 546 *Chemosphere* 29, 1743–1753.
- 547 SCHERER MM, RICHTER S, VALENTINE RL, and ALVAREZ PJJ (2000) Chemistry and
 548 microbiology of permeable reactive barriers for in situ groundwater clean up. *Rev.*549 *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 30, 363–411.
- SCHÜTH C, BILL M, BARTH JAC, SLATER GF, and KALIN RM (2003) Carbon isotope
 fractionation during reductive dechlorination of TCE in batch experiments with iron
 samples from reactive barriers. *J. Contam. Hydrol.* 66, 25–37.
- SCOTT TB, POPESCU IC, CRANE RA, and NOUBACTEP C (2011) Nano-scale metallic
 iron for the treatment of solutions containing multiple inorganic contaminants. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 186, 280–287.
- SIMON F-G, BIERMANN V, SEGEBADE C, and HEDRICH M (2004) Behaviour of
 uranium in hydroxyapatite-bearing permeable reactive barriers: investigation using
 237U as a radioindicator. *Sci. Tot. Environ.* 326, 249–256.
- SIMON FG, BIERMANN V, and PEPLINSKI B (2008) Uranium removal from groundwater
 using hydroxyapatite. *Appl. Geochem.* 23, 2137–2145.
- 561 STONE AT (1987) Microbial metabolites and the reductive dissolution of manganese oxides:
 562 Oxalate and pyruvate. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 51, 919–925.
- 563 STONE AT and ULRICH H-J (1989) Kinetics and reaction stoichiometry in the reductive
 564 dissolution of manganese(IV) dioxide and co(III) oxide by hydroquinone. J. Colloid
 565 Interface Sci. 132, 509–522.
- SU C, and PULS RW (2004) Significance of iron(II,III) hydroxycarbonate green rust in
 arsenic remediation using zerovalent iron in laboratory column tests. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 38, 5224–5231.
- 569 THIRUVENKATACHARI R, VIGNESWARAN S, and NAIDU R (2008) Permeable 570 reactive barrier for groundwater remediation. *J. Ind. Eng. Chem.* **14**, 145–156.
- 571 TIPPING E (1986) Some aspects of the interactions between particulate oxides and aquatic
 572 humic substances. *Mar. Chem.* 18, 161–169.

- 573 TIPPING E, and HIGGINS DC (1982) The effect of adsorbed humic substances on the 574 colloid stability of haematite particles. *Colloids Surf.* **5**, 85–92.
- 575 TRATNYEK PG, and SALTER AJ (2010) Response to comment on "degradation of 1,2,3576 trichloropropane (TCP): Hydrolysis, elimination, and reduction by iron and zinc".
 577 *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 44, 3198–3199.
- 578 VANSTONE N, PRZEPIORA A, VOGAN J, LACRAMPE-COULOUME G, POWERS B,
 579 PEREZ E, MABURY S, and LOLLAR BS (2005) Monitoring trichloroethene
- remediation at an iron permeable reactive barrier using stable carbon isotopic analysis. *J. Contam. Hydrol.* 78, 313–325.
- 582 WANG CB, ZHANG W-X (1997) Synthesizing nanoscale iron particles for rapid and
 583 complete dechlorination of TCE and PCBs. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 31, 2154–2156.
- 584 WEBER EJ (1996) Iron-mediated reductive transformations: investigation of reaction
 585 mechanism. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 30, 716–719.
- 586 WILDERER PA, BUNGARTZ H-J, LEMMER H, WAGNER M, KELLER J, and WUERTZ
- 587 S (2002) Modern scientific methods and their potential in wastewater science and 588 technology. *Water Res.* **36**, 370–393.
- WILKIN RT, and MCNEIL M (2003) Laboratory evaluation of zero-valent iron to treat water
 impacted by acid mine drainage. *Chemosphere* 53, 715–725.
- 591 YAO K-M, HABIBIAN MT, and O'MELIA CR (1971) Water and waste water filtration:
 592 concepts and applications. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 5, 1105–1112.
- YUAN S, ZHENG Z, MENG X-Z, CHEN J, and WANG L (2010) Surfactant mediated HCB
 dechlorination in contaminated soils and sediments by micro and nanoscale Cu/Fe
 Particles. *Geoderma* 159, 165–173.

596

Table 1: Overview on important results of the four first published peer-reviewed articles on the $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$ system (1994) and the number of their citations in Scopus (2011/03/27). It can be seen that none of these seminal works has demonstrated quantitative contaminant reduction. Moreover, the least cited work is the one which has created conditions for favorable contaminant reduction (acidification by FeS₂). X stands for contaminant; RCl is a chlorinated hydrocarbon.

602

Reference	Systems	X	Findings	Citations
Matheson and Tratnyek	Fe ⁰ /H ₂ O	CH _x Cl _y	Degradation mostly by Fe ⁰	616
Gillham and O'Hannesin	Fe ⁰ /H ₂ O	RCl	Enhanced degradation	597
Schreier and Reinhard	Fe^0/H_2O	C_2Cl_4	Partial degradation	65
Lipczynska-Kochany et al. F	Fe ⁰ /FeS ₂ /H ₂ O	CCl_4	FeS ₂ accelerates degradation	49

603 604